

BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
SOUTHWEST OHIO REGIONAL TRANSIT AUTHORITY

MINUTES OF: Regular Meeting of the SORTA Board of Trustees

DATE: Tuesday, March 21, 2017, 9:00 AM  
SORTA/Metro, Mt. Adams Board Room  
602 Main Street  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT: Jason Dunn, Ken Reed, Maurice Brown, Brendon Cull, Kreg Keesee, Gwen Robinson, Daniel St. Charles

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT: Heidi Black, Gary Greenberg, Mary Miller, Karl Schultz

STAFF MEMBERS: Dwight Ferrell, Donna Adkins, Matt Conover, Alison DeFisher, Paul Grether, Darryl Haley, Sallie Hilvers, Mary Huller, Brandy Jones, Carla McHale, Ted Meyer, Knox O'Callahan, Sean O'Leary, Demarcus Peters, John Ravasio, David Riposo, Ronnie Salerno, Shannel Satterfield, Monai Smith, TJ Thorn, Mike Weil

OTHERS: Tony Osterlund (Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP), Nick Vehr & Darcy Schwass (Vehr Communications), Sharon Coolidge (Enquirer), Troy Miller, Aaron Romine, Orlando King, Inga McGlocklin, Rico Owens & Dan Reynolds (ATU Local 627), Gina Marsh (Human Services Chamber), Thurman Wenzel (Cincinnati Interfaith Workers' Center), Craig Rozen (Cin Ego. Eng. Corp.), Lauren O'Brien & Daniel Miller (City of Cincinnati), Megan Hulse (DSD Advisors, LLC), Kelli Pratter (EHS), Jeremy Moses (Citizen), Andy Shenk (Citizen), Manuel Foggie (Citizen), Matt Deininger (Citizen), Jeff Smith (Citizen), Derek Balman (Citizen), Malcolm Timmons (Citizen), Michael Beck (Citizen), Robert Shuemak (Citizen)

**CALL TO ORDER**

Mr. Dunn, SORTA Board Chair, called the meeting to order.

**PLEDGE OF ALLIGANCE**

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

**HEARINGS FROM CITIZENS**

Mr. Dunn asked if there were any citizens present who would like to address the Board.

Jeremy Moses addressed the Board. He is a resident of Springdale and spoke regarding how fare increases and cutting routes would affect those with disabilities. He stated that he would like to work with the Board to convince voters that a tax levy benefits everyone.

Troy Miller, ATU President, addressed the Board and presented updates on the streetcar talks. He also spoke about the new gun laws going into effect and that operators should be allowed to carry weapons. He mentioned that March 18 was operator appreciation day.

Aaron Romine, an operator of 12 years, addressed the Board and stated that operators were not satisfied and not being treated fairly. He raised an issue regarding operators not being able to get time off due to the shortage of operators. He also raised a concern about the fleet of new buses only serving the suburbs.

Thurman Wenzel, Cincinnati Interfaith Workers' Center, addressed the Board regarding regional funding solutions and the contribution to transit service.

Michael Beck addressed the Board. He is a downtown resident and spoke regarding finding other solutions to cutting service. He spoke about shared services with other counties, smart cities and transportation, logistics and technology. He invited the Board to attend the Smart Cincy Summit on April 22<sup>nd</sup>.

Andy Shenk addressed the Board. He lives in Mt. Adams and does not own a car. He spoke about the limitations in Cincinnati for individuals that do not own vehicles and want to have an active lifestyle. He stated that a coalition is forming to support the transit system.

Gina Marsh, Human Services Agency, addressed the Board regarding support of additional funding for transit. She stated that her agency provides a variety of services to members of the community that rely on the transit system. She stated that transit is crucial to reducing poverty. She also addressed service reductions and fare increases.

Craig Rozen addressed the Board and offered a different perspective; one of youth engagement. He spoke about Cincinnati Public Schools relying on the transit system and the constraints of start times. He presented a copy of the minutes for the Cincinnati Public Schools Board Meeting.

Derek Balman addressed the Board and spoke about the local branch of the NAACP addressing the issue of public transportation being a civil right during the national conference in July of 2016. He spoke of cities and regions across the country investing in public transportation. He stated that more than 20% of households do not have vehicles.

Jeff Smith addressed the Board regarding an incident on a Metro bus with someone carrying a firearm. He petitioned the Board to take the proper steps to get it right.

Robert Schumaker addressed the Board as a rider of Metro for 18 years and an advocate for Metro. He stated that there was support from Hamilton County DD Services.

#### **APPROVAL OF FEBRUARY 21, 2017 BOARD MEETING MINUTES**

Ms. Robinson made a motion that the minutes of the February 21, 2017 meeting be approved as previously mailed and Mr. Reed seconded the motion.

By voice vote, the Board approved the minutes.

#### **FINANCE COMMITTEE**

Mr. Keese reported on the Finance committee meeting that was held on March 14, 2017 and presented the following to the Board for approval:

#### **Proposed Resolution No. 2017-03: Approval of the Preliminary 2018 Budget and Funding Request**

Mr. St. Charles moved for adoption and Mr. Mosby seconded the motion. SORTA staff has prepared a preliminary transit operating plan for 2018 which is now being submitted to the SORTA Board for approval. In accordance with the 2018 operating plan of \$99,382,000, SORTA staff recommends requesting funding from the City of Cincinnati Transit Fund of \$54,800,000 for operating purposes and an additional \$3,019,000 (\$2,000,000 from loss contingency reserves and \$1,019,000 from the transit fund, resulting in a less than 10% reserve balance) from reserves in order to balance the 2018 budget.

In order to be able to effectively manage SORTA's insurance risk management program, it is recommended that the Board also request the \$3,000,000 remaining of the loss contingency reserve fund be transferred to SORTA to be held in a designated self-insurance account.

By roll call vote, the Board unanimously approved Resolution No. 2017-03.

#### **Proposed Resolution No. 2017-04: Approval of Joint Cooperative Agreement with OKI Regional Council of Governments for FY 2015 Allocation of FTA Section 5310 Program Funds**

Mr. Reed moved for adoption and Mr. Brown seconded the motion. Mr. Keese proposed a new agreement between SORTA and OKI to administer the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) FY 2015 Section 5310 Program funds. He stated SORTA has previously entered into similar agreements with OKI for Rounds 1 and 2, as for Round 3, SORTA would procure nine (9) vehicles from the State of Ohio DOT contract on behalf of the non-profit sub-recipients. OKI would monitor sub-recipient compliance with vehicle usage requirements and administer a preventive maintenance expense reimbursement process. The grant provides 80% of vehicle cost, with 20% local match to be paid to SORTA in advance.

By roll call vote, the Board unanimously approved Resolution No. 2017-04.

**Proposed Motion:      Approval of Payment to CareWorks**

Mr. Reed moved for adoption and Mr. St. Charles seconded the motion. This motion requested the board approve the final anticipated payment of \$2,200 for FMLA services from CareWorks for the March 2017 invoice. This would result in the total cost exceeding the \$100,000 threshold requiring Board approval.

By voice vote, the Board approved the motion.

**PLANNING & OPERATIONS COMMITTEE**

Mr. Reed reported on the Planning & Operations Committee meeting that was held on March 14, 2017, and presented the following to the Board:

**Proposed Motion:      Approval of Use of Ohio Public Authorities Disparity Study**

Mr. Reed moved for adoption and Mr. Cull seconded the motion. Mr. Reed explained that this motion is to approve the use of the Ohio Public Authorities Disparity study; to support SORTA's implementation of the Disadvantage Business Enterprise Program (DBE). The information in the study is helpful in setting overall goals for the participation of DBE's and determining appropriate program measures to encourage the participation of minority and women owned businesses.

By voice vote, the Board approved the motion.

**Proposed Resolution No. 2017-05:      Appointment of Brad Thomas as a Royal Coachperson**

Mr. Reed moved for adoption and Mr. Mosby seconded the motion. Mr. Thomas was first appointed a member of the Board of Trustees of the Southwest Ohio Regional Transit Authority on April 25, 2012. Mr. Thomas was a loyal and dedicated board member and his expertise contributed greatly to the improvement of public transportation. The efforts of Mr. Thomas to the public welfare should be recognized.

By roll call vote, the Board unanimously approved Resolution No. 2017-05.

**PERSONNEL & POLICIES COMMITTEE**

Ms. Robinson reported on the Personnel & Planning Committee meeting that was held on March 14, 2017, and presented the following to the Board:

**Proposed Motion:      Approval of Weapons on Metro Property Policies – Employees, Customers, and Visitors**

Mr. Mosby moved for adoption and Mr. Reed seconded the motion. Ms. Robinson noted that SORTA's current weapons policy needs to be revised in order to be consistent with the new "gun-in-trunk" law that becomes effective in March 2017. Legal Counsel recommends an addition to Weapons on Metro Property – Employees be approved by the SORTA Board in order to be in compliance.

By voice vote, the Board approved the motion.

**BRIEFING ITEMS**

**Ridership Report for January and February 2017**

Mr. Conover provided the January & February 2017 ridership report. Mr. Conover reported there were no significant changes in ridership.

In review the total ridership for January was 1,215,216, which was 1.5% above budget. On-time performance was 87.2% for local routes, against a goal of 88%. Local routes are carrying 22.3 passengers per hour, against a goal of 20.7 and express routes are carrying 15.6 passengers per trip, against a goal of 16.2. The January 2017 Access ridership report; total ridership for Access was 18,663, up 2.5% from budget. Year-to-

date Access ridership was up 2.5% or 468 rides. On-time performance was 93.6% against a goal of 93%. The Cincinnati Bell Connector ridership report for January 2017; total ridership was 35,334, down 60% and 52,105 from budget. On-time performance was 31.8% against a goal of 95.0%. The streetcar is carrying 27.6 passengers per hour against a goal of 52.8.

February Ridership was also. Total ridership for February was 1,181,731 which were 3.7% above budget. On-time performance was 86.1% for local routes, against a goal of 88%. Local routes are carrying 23.3 passengers per hour, against a goal of 20.7 and express routes are carrying 15.3 passengers per trip, against a goal of 16.2. The February 2017 Access ridership report; total ridership for Access was 37,488, up 14.1% from budget. Year-to-date Access ridership was up 10% or down 5,094 rides. On-time performance was 90.5% against a goal of 93%. The Cincinnati Bell Connector ridership report for February 2017; total ridership was 36,677, down 49.1% and 35,334 from budget. On-time performance was 32.7% against a goal of 95.0%. The streetcar is carrying 32.3 passengers per hour against a goal of 52.8.

### **Monthly Financial Report for January and February 2017**

Mr. Riposo presented the January 2017 financial reports. Total revenues were \$8.2 million, which is unfavorable to budget by \$75,000 or 0.9%. Total expenses were \$7.8 million, which is favorable to budget by \$471,000 or 5.0%. The end result was a net favorable variance of \$396,000 for the month. Fare revenue was unfavorable to budget by \$49,000 or 3.0% for the month due to lower pass sales of \$38,000 than budgeted. He also presented the Cincinnati Bell Connector financial report for January 2017. Total revenues were \$298,501, which is unfavorable to budget by \$32,575 or 10%. Total expenses were \$321,055 which is favorable to budget by \$10,021 or 3%. The end result is a net unfavorable variable of \$22,554 for the month. Mr. Riposo then reviewed the contributing factors to these variances.

He also presented the February 2017 financial reports. Total revenues were \$7.6 million, which is unfavorable to budget by \$9,000 or 0.1%. Total expenses were \$7.2 million, which is favorable to budget by \$432,000 or 5.7%. The end result was a net favorable variance of \$423,000 for the month. Fare revenue was favorable to budget by \$34,000 or 2.4% for the month due to increased full adult fare revenue/ridership. For the Cincinnati Bell Connector financial report, total revenues were \$302,522, which is unfavorable to budget by \$28,554 or 9%. Total expenses were \$319,831 which is favorable to budget by \$11,245 or 3%. The end result is a net unfavorable variable of \$17,309 for the month. Mr. Riposo then reviewed the contributing factors to these variances.

### **Rail Update for February 2017**

Mr. Grether provided the February 2017 Rail Update. Mr. Grether reported there were no significant changes or issues at this time with Rail.

### **CEO BOARD UPDATE**

Mr. Ferrell stated that the various Coffee Chats have been positive and that they would be shifting the dates to weekends. He deferred to the reading of the other areas of the *CEO Board Update*, found in the Board books.

### **NEW BUSINESS**

Mr. Brown presented a photo of a shelter on Route 50 that was in poor condition. He was concerned with the image it created for Metro. Mr. Haley stated that the shelter was not a Metro shelter and that he would be working with the city to determine the history on the shelter and if it could be removed.

Mr. Reed moved to adjourn the meeting and Mr. Dunn seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 10:42 AM.

### **NEXT MEETING**

The next regular meeting of the SORTA Board of Trustees is scheduled for Tuesday, April 25, 2017 at 6:00 PM, location to be determined.

APPROVED:

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Jason Dunn". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, prominent "J" and "D".

Jason Dunn  
Chair, SORTA Board

ATTESTED:

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Dwight A. Ferrell". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, prominent "D" and "F".

Dwight A. Ferrell  
CEO & General Manager